

Environment Scrutiny Panel

PUBLIC MEETING

Record of Meeting

Date: 11th February 2009

Meeting Number: 3

Present	Deputy P Rondel (Chairman) (PR) Connétable J Réfaut (JR) Deputy D Wimberley (DW) (Not items 1 & 2)
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	M Haden, M Orbell

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
	1. Records of Meetings The minutes of the meeting of 23 rd January 2009 were approved and signed.	MO
	2. Ramsar Review: Request for information The Panel noted that confirmation and details requested in a letter to the Minister for Planning and Environment on 27 th January 2009 as to whether the Department had now contacted the Ramsar Secretariat had not been received. It was understood that this information might be considered sensitive by the Department in view of the forthcoming rescindment debate on the La Collette Energy from Waste (EfW) Plant; however, as the debate had now been postponed until the next States sitting on 24 th February members agreed it was important to follow the matter up to avoid unnecessary delay to the review. Officers were requested to make contact with the Department by telephone and authorised to offer a temporary confidentiality agreement until the conclusion of the debate if this was felt to be necessary by the Department.	MO
	3. Correspondence with Ministers The Panel noted recent correspondence with the Ministers for Planning And Environment and Transport and Technical Services. In view of the potential overlap between the Panel's review and the rescindment proposition brought as a private member by Deputy Wimberley it was agreed that information received by the Panel should not be released into the public domain in future until 'signed off' by the Chairman.	PR/JR/DW /MH/MO
23.01.09 /Item 5	4. Proposed Town Park/Ann Court Car Park It was agreed that Connétable Réfaut would attend and take notes on behalf of the Panel at the evening public meeting regarding proposals for Ann Court to be held at the Town Hall on 12 th February 2009.	JR
23.01.09 /Item 4	5. Jersey's Ramsar Site: Impact of Energy from Waste Plant The Panel approved draft terms of reference for the review. It was agreed that these could be forwarded to the Minister for Planning and Environment for information and his comments. Updated review files and background folders containing copies of all	MH/MO

	<p>material received so far by the Scrutiny Office were distributed to members. Officers were asked to contact the Transport and Technical Services Department to check that the Panel was in possession of the latest versions of all documents, as some of the information received from the Planning Department had required updating.</p> <p>Members were briefed on background research carried out by officers and directions suggested for the review. Deputy Wimberley informed the Panel that he was conflicted in the matter of the content of the Environmental Impact Statement as this was also being analysed in respect of his private rescindment proposition (P.8/2009). It was agreed that he would make no use of information obtained or supplied by Scrutiny in progressing his proposition and that all information received so far would be subject to an embargo until the debate (now re-scheduled for 24th February 2009) was concluded. This would also allow the Panel time to begin evaluating the large quantities of information already received.</p> <p>The Panel discussed whether its review should encompass all possible pollution arising from the La Collette site that might affect the Ramsar area, including any generated during the construction phase or possibly arising from disturbance of existing sources of contamination on site. It was agreed that as the construction period was specifically considered under the Environmental Impact Assessment this should be included in the Panel's review. Consequently officers were asked to request a plan from the Transport and Technical Services Department showing the location of all sealed ash pits on the site. Concerns were also raised about the proposed cooling water outflow from the plant into the Ramsar site. Officers were asked to research UK and European sources concerning similar discharges into the sea and to confirm what happened to cooling water from the current Bellozanne plant.</p>	<p>MH/MO</p> <p>DW</p> <p>PR/JR/DW/ MH/MO</p> <p>MH/MO</p> <p>MH/MO</p>
	<p>6. Request for Funding – Peer Review</p> <p>Further to a request from Deputy Wimberley concerning the possibility of Panel funding for peer review of materials relating to his proposition calling for rescindment of the Energy from Waste facility (P.8/2009), the Panel agreed that as this was a private proposition not related to the existing Panel work programme, the provision of any funding by Scrutiny would not be appropriate. Deputy Wimberley accepted that his proposition and the Panel's review into the impact of the energy from waste plant on the Ramsar site were separate matters.</p>	
	<p>7. Programme of Legislation and Propositions</p> <p>Members considered the timetable of propositions to be lodged in 2009 by the Transport and Technical Services and Planning and Environment Departments. Officers were asked to request that information on new fisheries legislation, changes to legislation in respect of listed buildings and the rural economy strategy be added to consideration of the draft Energy Strategy as topics for the next quarterly briefing meeting with the Planning and Environment Minister. It was agreed that the Panel would keep a watching brief on the issue of environmental taxes and the Fisheries Agreement with Guernsey. The Panel confirmed its intent to review the Integrated Travel and Transport Policy and Liquid Waste Strategies from the Transport and Technical Services Department and the new Island Plan from Planning and Environment in due course; members</p>	<p>MH/MO</p>

	also felt that (time permitting) they would be interested to look at proposals for Climate Change Adaptation and Construction and Use Regulations (Vehicles) later in 2009.	
	<p>8. Chairmen's Committee</p> <p>The Panel received briefing notes of the Chairmen's Committee meetings of 22nd and 29th January 2009 and noted that the Vice Chairman would represent the Panel at the next meeting on 19th February 2009, owing to the Chairman's absence from the Island on holiday.</p>	DW
	<p>9. Corporate Services Panel Legacy Report</p> <p>In response to a proposal contained in the legacy report of the previous Corporate Services Panel for a Finance Sub-Panel to include members from each of the Scrutiny Panels, the Chairman confirmed that he was still hoping to recruit a further member to the Panel, either on a permanent or co-opted basis, but until that was achieved it would be difficult to spare one of the three existing members to serve on a Sub-Panel.</p> <p>The framework for scrutiny of the Annual Business Plan was discussed; it was noted that timings this year would be unusual owing to the development of the new States Strategic Plan.</p>	PR
	<p>10. Ministerial Decisions</p> <p>Decisions made by the Ministers for Planning and Environment and Transport and Technical Services in January 2009 were noted.</p>	
	<p>11. Questions to Ministers</p> <p>Members noted arrangements for questions without notice to Ministers for the sitting of 10th March 2009. It was felt that the system was not working particularly well owing to the fact that only one supplementary was allowed, which was often insufficient to elicit a complete answer.</p>	
	<p>12. States Energy Consumption</p> <p>The Panel agreed that a short review of States energy consumption should be added to its work programme. Officers were asked to prepare assessment and scoping documents.</p>	MH/MO
23.01.09 /Item 14	<p>13. Geothermal Energy Initiative</p> <p>The Chairman pointed out that he had been misquoted in recent media coverage of possibilities for a geothermal energy initiative to heat States Housing and asked for it to be minuted that he was still assessing the economics of this type of installation, and had not stated that it was cheaper than using electricity.</p>	
	<p>14. Energy Efficient Housing</p> <p>Correspondence including outline plans and drawings for an energy efficient home currently the subject of a planning application were circulated. It was agreed that details of the specific 'eco-friendly' elements would be of interest but that the Panel could not be seen to support a specific development for any applicant. Officers were asked to write to the Minister for Planning and Environment and the applicant requesting further details and working drawings but advising them of the Panel's obligation in these circumstances to remain impartial.</p>	MH/MO
23.01.09 /Item 6	<p>15. States Strategic Plan</p> <p>The Panel noted the Strategic Plan priorities and dates for the formal Scrutiny process. It was considered that in the light of recent revelations about the severity of the economic situation there was a risk that environmental concerns might be sidelined. It was agreed that the Panel would need to focus on sustainability issues, both in terms of reducing costs to the States and identifying ways for the</p>	

	public to respond to economic challenges ahead.	
	<p>16. Correspondence: Derek Mason Architects Ltd. The Panel considered correspondence from Derek Mason Architects Ltd. dated 2nd February 2009, referring to consultancy work carried out by the company for the former Environment Panel in respect of the design of homes and town regeneration and suggesting a meeting to discuss how this could be taken further. The Panel agreed to inform the company that such topics were not included in its current priorities but it would keep the offer on file.</p>	MH/MO
	<p>17. Bus Service Members discussed reports that certain country bus routes had been dropped from the timetable by Connex during the winter season. It was agreed that in the first instance these were constituency matters but that the effectiveness of the bus service would be a priority when the Panel came to review the Integrated Travel and Transport Policy. A timetable for the ITTP should be requested at the next meeting with the Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</p>	MH/MO

Signed



Date:



Chairman
Environment Panel